

Muhammad Ikram Idrus

Program Studi Ekonomi Pembangunan, Fakultas Ekonomi dan Bisnis, Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar

Muhammad Ihsan Said Ahmad

Program Studi Pendidikan Ekonomi, Fakultas Ilmu Ekonomi, Universitas Negeri Makassar

Muhammad Ishlah Idrus

Program Studi Akuntansi, Politeknik Negeri Ujung Pandang

Alamat: Jl. Sultan Alauddin No.259, Gn. Sari, Kec. Rappocini, Kota Makassar, Sulawesi Selatan 90221 Korespondensi penulis: <u>muh.ikram@unismuh.ac.id</u>

Abstract. In the era of globalisation and increasingly fierce competition, the sustainability of human resources (HR) becomes very important for the success of the organisation. Organisations that have effective career development strategies are able to retain quality human resources, increase productivity, and create a competitive advantage. The purpose of this study is to identify and analyse effective career development strategies in improving HR sustainability in organisations. The current research type is qualitative. Data collection techniques include listening and recording important information to conduct data analysis through data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing. The study results show that in the context of improving HR sustainability in organisations, career development strategies play a very important role. In the above, we have discussed effective and relevant career development strategies by accommodating individual personality preferences and ensuring a match between the individual, the work environment, and organisational values. Holland's Career Choice Theory provides valuable insights in designing sustainable career development strategies.

Keywords: Career, Human Resources, Organisation.

Abstrak. Pada era globalisasi dan persaingan yang semakin ketat, keberlanjutan sumber daya manusia (SDM) menjadi sangat penting bagi keberhasilan organisasi. Organisasi yang memiliki strategi pengembangan karier yang efektif mampu mempertahankan SDM yang berkualitas, meningkatkan produktivitas, dan menciptakan keunggulan kompetitif. Tujuan penelitian ini adalah untuk mengidentifikasi dan menganalisis strategi pengembangan karier yang efektif dalam meningkatkan keberlanjutan SDM dalam organisasi. Jenis penelitian saat ini adalah kualitatif. Teknik pengumpulan data meliputi menyimak dan mencatat informasi penting untuk melakukan analisis data melalui reduksi data, *display data*, dan penarikan kesimpulan. Hasil studi menunjukkan bahwa dalam konteks meningkatkan keberlanjutan SDM dalam organisasi, strategi pengembangan karier memainkan peran yang sangat penting. Dalam penjelasan di atas, telah dibahas mengenai strategi pengembangan karier yang efektif dan mengakomodasi preferensi kepribadian individu dan memastikan kecocokan antara individu, lingkungan kerja, dan nilai-nilai organisasi. *Holland's Career Choice Theory*

memberikan pandangan yang berharga dalam merancang strategi pengembangan karier yang berkelanjutan.

Kata kunci: Karier, SDM, Organisasi.

BACKGROUND

In the current context of globalisation and intensified competition, the preservation and sustainability of human resources (HR) play a critical role in determining the success of an organisation (Gadzali, Ausat, et al., 2023). Organisations with effective career development strategies are able to retain highly skilled human resources, increase productivity levels, and build competitive advantage (Gadzali, Gazalin, et al., 2023). Therefore, it is imperative to conduct research on strategies related to career development to gain insight into how organisations can improve the sustainability of their human resources. Career development is a deliberate and sustained effort that includes enhancing an individual's skills, knowledge and competencies to achieve their career goals (Sun & Wang, 2012). In the realm of organisational dynamics, career development strategies encompass a comprehensive framework consisting of policies, programs, and practices specifically formulated to facilitate the development of employees' inherent capabilities, the achievement of their career aspirations, and maximising their contributions to the organisation (Fallah Shayan et al., 2022) and (Barhate & Dirani, 2022).

However, a large number of organisations continue to show deficiencies in implementing sound career development strategies. Organisations face various challenges, such as deficiencies in understanding their employees' development requirements, lack of critical resources, and limited employee engagement in their career development efforts. In addition, the dynamic nature of the business environment requires organisations to consistently adapt and develop new relevant competencies.

The study of career development strategies can provide significant insights for organisations looking to improve the sustainability of their human capital. Organisations can improve their development programs, talent retention, and employee retention by understanding the needs and expectations of their employees. In addition, the implementation of effective career development strategies can increase employee motivation and engagement, resulting in beneficial outcomes in terms of productivity and overall organisational performance.

The main objective of this study is to analyse career development strategies in enhancing the long-term viability of human resources within organisations. The research aims to provide recommendations and guidance for organisations in designing and implementing effective career development strategies by examining best practices from various organisations. It is also hoped that this research will increase organisations' understanding of the importance of a robust career development strategy and recognise the beneficial implications for long-term human resource sustainability. Organisations can achieve quality employee development and retention, increased productivity, and sustainable competitiveness in a dynamic business environment through the implementation of effective strategies.

THEORETICAL REVIEW

One theory that is often used in research on career development strategies to improve HR sustainability in organisations is Holland's Career Choice Theory (Hoff et al., 2020). This theory was developed by John L. Holland and is often used to understand how individuals choose and develop their careers (Maldonado et al., 2020). The underlying premise of this theory states that individuals have enduring interests and personalities, and that there is a fit between these attributes and specific job roles. Based on the theoretical framework, there are six main personality or interest classifications that serve as indicators of an individual's predisposition towards a particular work environment. These personality types are Realistic, Investigative, Artistic, Social, Enterprising, and Conventional (Adlya & Zola, 2022).

In the realm of career development strategies, this theory has the potential to assist organisations in understanding the methods that can be used to discern and exploit individual interests and personalities, so as to build relevant and inspiring career trajectories. Organisations can use interest and personality tests, such as the Kuder Career Search, Self-Directed Search, or Strong Interest Inventory, to help individuals understand their career preferences and develop development strategies accordingly.

In addition, the theory also underlines the importance of alignment between one's personality type and the demands of their job. For example, individuals who exhibit an Investigative personality may have a greater aptitude for jobs that require critical analysis and problem-solving skills. Conversely, individuals who exhibit an Enterprising personality may feel more suited to positions that emphasise leadership or business-oriented responsibilities. Organisations can effectively implement career development strategies by applying Holland's Career Choice Theory, which emphasises the importance of identifying and enhancing

alignment between an individual's interests, personality traits and chosen career trajectory. This initiative has the potential to increase employee satisfaction and engagement, thereby contributing to the long-term viability of the human resource function within the organisation. This is achieved by optimising individual capabilities and encouraging the retention of valuable talent.

RESEARCH METHODS

This research aims to analyse career development strategies to improve HR sustainability in organisations. In this study, the researcher conducted desk research so that there was no need to go directly to the field during the data collection process, but rather examine various reference sources that support this research. Literature was obtained from online media and databases from journal portals in accordance with keywords related to this discussion, namely career development strategies and their relation to improving HR sustainability in organisations. The author does not focus on specific journal portals or online media in determining relevant reference sources such as referring to Emerald Insight, ResearchGate, and Elsevier journal portals, but is more flexible. In this article, with a focus on public sector development strategies as a driver of economic growth, the author made the keywords the focus of the search so as not to widen the main discussion. The search for journals, articles, and publications was mostly in the range of articles published between 2010 and 2023. Not all articles, journals, and publications that appear in the search results will be used, but only those related to improving HR sustainability in organisations.

This research is a type of qualitative research. Data collection techniques include listening and recording important information to conduct data analysis through data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing to obtain a picture of the conclusions regarding the literature study that will be developed in this study. Data validation uses triangulation of data sources.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Career development strategy refers to a set of actions and policies formulated by an organisation with the aim of assisting employees in realising their potential, achieving career goals, and enhancing the long-term sustainability of human resources (HR) within the organisation. In this day and age, the concept of HR sustainability has emerged as an important focal point for organisations looking to secure their survival and expansion. Therefore, the implementation of a sound career development strategy is critical to achieving this goal.

An integral component of a career development strategy involves recognising and evaluating individual needs. Each employee has different talents, interests and aspirations that need to be accommodated by the organisation (Rustiawan et al., 2023) and (Fitriah et al., 2023). Therefore, it is imperative for organisations to conduct regular employee appraisal procedures to ascertain the latent capabilities possessed by each individual. This can include activities such as conducting performance appraisals, managing competency assessments, and facilitating career development interviews. The results of these evaluations can then form the basis for formulating career development strategies that are in line with individual needs and aspirations.

In addition, it is imperative for organisations to adopt a holistic perspective and ensure career development requirements are aligned with the company's overall vision, mission and strategic goals. For example, if a company is undergoing a transition to become a more technology-centric entity, the enhancement of digital proficiency and technical knowledge can take a significant role in the framework of a career development strategy. By aligning individual career goals with organisational strategic requirements, companies can build and maintain a sustainable human capital framework that matches their overall business growth trajectory (Febrian et al., 2023).

Following the identification of individual and organisational needs, the next stage in career development strategy is the formulation of a comprehensive career development plan. The proposed plan should include specific steps that individuals will take to achieve their career goals, which include related training, educational activities, special projects or additional responsibilities. Organisations have the capacity to offer essential resources and assistance to facilitate employees in achieving their goals, which may include provisions for internal or external training, mentoring opportunities, or job rotation initiatives (Sutrisno et al., 2023).

Further, it is important to build an organisational culture that encourages and facilitates employees' professional career growth and advancement. This includes recognising and incentivising employees' efforts at professional growth, promoting based on merit, and providing opportunities for vertical and lateral mobility within the organisational structure. When employees feel valued and find tangible prospects for personal and professional advancement, their motivation to actively engage in career development will increase, leading to a positive contribution to the sustainability of the human resource function (Setyawati et al., 2022). Then, career development strategies should incorporate a systematic monitoring and evaluation framework to assess their effectiveness. Through systematic observation of employee performance, organisations can assess the extent to which the career development

plan has effectively achieved its stated objectives and determine whether modifications or expansions are required. These evaluations also provide valuable feedback to employees, allowing them to improve and focus their career development efforts.

In the broader context of career development strategies, it is imperative to recognise the importance of technology and innovation. The impact of technological advancements in the field of information technology has significantly shaped work processes and skill requirements in various sectors (Ausat, 2023). Therefore, it is imperative for organisations to incorporate elements of digitalisation into their career development strategies and enable employees to develop technological competencies aligned with future demands.

To ensure long-term human resource (HR) continuity within organisations, it is imperative to implement a comprehensive and sustainable career development strategy. By placing emphasis on enhancing individual skills and competencies, aligning them with organisational needs, formulating a comprehensive career development strategy, fostering a supportive organisational culture, and implementing regular appraisals, companies can create a conducive environment that facilitates the sustainable growth and development of their employees. In an era marked by rapid change, the importance of an adaptive and changeresponsive career development strategy is increasing, as it plays a crucial role in ensuring an organisation's sustainability and competitive advantage.

In conjunction with the above steps, there are some additional factors to consider in a career development strategy that aims to improve the continuity of human resources within the organisation:

- Career Mapping and Pathways to Advancement: Providing employees with clear career mapping is very important. This can include comprehensive information on the different roles and corresponding responsibilities within the organisation, as well as potential career progression trajectories. In addition, career mapping can also include an examination of the skills or competencies required to progress up each career ladder. By providing comprehensive information on the various career paths that are accessible, employees will experience increased motivation and a sense of purpose as they strive to improve their skill sets (Az-zaakiyyah et al., 2022).
- Leadership Development: In the realm of career development, it is imperative to recognise the importance of incorporating leadership development strategies. The aim is to spot employees who show leadership potential and then offer them training and opportunities to

develop and enhance their leadership capabilities. The formation and maintenance of a strong and durable leadership cadre is critical to the long-term viability of the organisation, as this group will serve as a catalyst for transformation and guide the team effectively (Zen et al., 2023).

- 3. Flexibility and Mobility: Given the dynamic nature of the contemporary business landscape, it is imperative for organisations to develop a culture that encourages adaptability and mobility among its workforce. Possible options for fostering cross-functional collaboration within the organisation could include initiatives such as job rotation programmes or the implementation of special projects involving different departments or functions. By engaging in these practices, employees will be given the opportunity to develop a comprehensive understanding of the organisation and achieve invaluable cross-functional competencies.
- 4. Work-Life Balance: The concept of HR sustainability includes the imperative to establish and maintain a harmonious balance between professional obligations and employees' personal well-being. Advocate for policies and practices that encourage the provision of sufficient time for employees to engage in leisure activities, attend to physical health, and foster social relationships. The implementation of flexible work schedules or remote working arrangements can contribute to improving employee satisfaction and productivity (Wheatley, 2017) and (Nur'aeni et al., 2022).
- 5. 5. External Partnerships: Organisations can also partner with external educational institutions or training providers to enhance and broaden the scope of career development prospects. Organisations have the opportunity to enhance employee development by leveraging partnerships with universities, training institutions or industry associations. These collaborations provide access to a variety of specialised training programmes, resources and seminars.
- 6. Rewards and Incentives System: Recognising and incentivising employees who successfully achieve their career development goals is an important element in maintaining and enhancing human resource sustainability. It is advisable to offer various incentives, such as promotions, salary increases, bonuses, or other forms of rewards, to employees who demonstrate success in their professional growth and development. This will be an additional source of motivation for fellow employees to actively engage in self-development efforts.
- 7. Continuous Approach: The concept of career development should be considered as a continuous and iterative process, rather than a single, discrete event. It is essential to foster

a sense of awareness and dedication to consistently foster and support employees' professional growth throughout their tenure within the organisation. This can be achieved by implementing regular career development assessments and strategic planning, closely monitoring progress, and offering ongoing opportunities for learning and development.

Organisations can create an environment conducive to employee growth and development by implementing a comprehensive and sustainable career development strategy. The implementation of this strategy is expected to improve the continuity of human resources within the organisation, while fostering a conducive work environment, increasing employee satisfaction, and ultimately improving overall productivity.

From the perspective of Holland's Career Choice Theory, the implementation of a good career development strategy has the potential to improve the long-term sustainability of human resources (HR) within the organisation. This can be achieved by aligning individual preferences and aptitudes with the most suitable work environment. According to Holland's theory, there are six personality types that underlie individual career preferences. The six personality types are Realistic, Investigative, Artistic, Social, Enterprising, and Conventional. Holland also identified suitable work environments for each personality type.

Within the framework of career development strategies, it is imperative for organisations to have a comprehensive understanding of employees' career preferences and then ensure their placement in positions that suit their respective personality types. Individuals who have an Investigative personality type may have a higher degree of suitability for jobs that include research, data analysis, or new product development, to illustrate. On the other hand, individuals who have a Social personality type may show greater aptitude for jobs that require interpersonal engagement and contributions to society.

Organisations can facilitate employees in effectively strategising and directing their career paths towards work environments that match their personality preferences. Over time, this can improve human capital sustainability by encouraging higher levels of employee satisfaction and engagement through aligning their work with their individual interests and values.

In addition, Holland's Career Choice Theory places significant emphasis on the alignment between an individual's personality type and their skills and abilities. In the realm of career development strategies, it is imperative for organisations to provide relevant training and educational opportunities that facilitate the development of the skills necessary for

employees to excel in their desired roles. For example, individuals who exhibit the Realistic personality type may benefit from receiving instruction in technical or practical skills, whereas individuals who exhibit the Artistic personality type may find it beneficial to receive training in creativity or design.

Organisations can encourage their employees' career growth and advancement by offering opportunities and resources that suit their respective personality types (Weng & Zhu, 2020). This initiative has the potential to improve the sustainability of the human resources function, while encouraging higher levels of employee satisfaction and motivation, allowing everyone to maximise their contributions.

Furthermore, Holland's Career Choice Theory recognises the importance of alignment between an individual's personality traits, the characteristics of their work environment, and the values upheld by the organisation (Arnold, 2010). When implementing a career development strategy with a focus on sustainability, it is imperative for organisations to ensure that the values espoused by the individual and the organisation are aligned. This initiative will contribute to the establishment of a conducive work environment, fostering a sense of inclusion and appreciation among employees. Moreover, it will facilitate the alignment of personal interests and values of individuals with the overarching goals and cultural framework of the organisation.

In general, Holland's Career Choice Theory offers a valuable framework for the development of sustainable career strategies in an organisational context. Organisations can enhance HR sustainability and foster an environment conducive to individual and organisational growth and success by considering individual personality types, developing relevant skills, and building alignment between the individual, the work environment, and organisational values.

CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

Career development strategies are critical in improving the sustainability of human resources (HR) within organisations, especially in the context of improving sustainability. In the previous section, we discussed effective and relevant strategies for career development that involve considering individual personality preferences and building alignment between the individual, the work environment, and organisational values. Holland's Career Choice Theory makes a significant contribution to the development of sustainable strategies for career advancement. In the current context, it is imperative to systematically identify and assess the

specific needs of individuals and organisations to formulate efficient and impactful career development plans. This includes employee evaluation, career path development, and a comprehensive understanding of organisational requirements. There are several suggestions for organisations to build an HR career development strategy:

- Identify Personality Preferences: Organisations should know and understand the different personality types exhibited by their employees, as well as gain insight into their individual career preferences. This can be achieved by using personality assessments and related tests. By gaining a more comprehensive understanding of personality preferences, organisations can effectively guide employees towards roles that match their interests.
- 2. Career Development Assessment and Planning: Regularly conducts performance appraisals and competency assessments to identify employees' development potential and needs. Utilising the results obtained from these assessments, formulate an elaborate career development blueprint that includes sequential actions that individuals can take to effectively achieve their desired goals.
- 3. Relevant Training and Learning: It is critical to offer each individual the opportunity and essential resources needed to develop skills that align with their personality preferences as well as the needs of the organisation. Through internal and external training, employees have the opportunity to develop skills that match their professional trajectory and align with the evolving needs of the work environment.
- 4. Culture that Supports Career Development: Building a culture that encourages career development can be achieved through the implementation of strategies that recognise and incentivise employees' efforts for personal and professional development. Organisations should offer opportunities for vertical and lateral mobility, in addition to merit-based promotions. This initiative is expected to act as a catalyst to increase employee motivation and engagement in career development efforts, thereby having a constructive impact on the long-term viability and effectiveness of human resource management.
- 5. Evaluation and Improvement: It is significant to regularly assess the success of the career development strategies that have been implemented. Utilise feedback obtained from employees and evaluation results as a means to improve and refine existing career development initiatives.
- 6. Adaptability to Change: When examining the current landscape, it is imperative to consider technological advancements, shifts in workplace dynamics, and the ever-changing needs of

the organisation. It is imperative to continually update career development strategies to align with evolving circumstances and effectively meet emerging needs.

By implementing the above recommendations, organisations can build sustainable career development strategies, improve HR sustainability, and create a work environment that supports the growth and success of individuals and the organisation as a whole.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The entire team deserves congratulations and thanks for the successful completion of this journal research. The diligent efforts of each individual have resulted in a significant and important contribution to the scientific community. The potential benefits of this research are expected to reach a wide range of individuals and can be a source of inspiration for future research. Continue to engage in innovative practices and keep up the good work.

REFERENCES

- Adlya, S. I., & Zola, N. (2022). Holland's Theory to Guiding Individual Career Choices. *Jurnal Neo Konseling*, 4(4), 30. https://doi.org/10.24036/00698kons2022
- Arnold, J. (2010). The congruence problem in John Holland's theory of vocational decisions. Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology, 77(1), 95–113. https://doi.org/10.1348/096317904322915937
- Ausat, A. M. A. (2023). The Application of Technology in the Age of Covid-19 and Its Effects on Performance. *Apollo: Journal of Tourism and Business*, 1(1), 14–22. https://doi.org/10.58905/apollo.v1i1.8
- Az-zaakiyyah, H. K., Hidayat, F., Almaududi Ausat, A. M., & Suherlan, S. (2022). Islamic Rural Bank Employee Performance: Role of Motivation, Compensation, and Work Environment. *EkBis: Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Bisnis*, 6(1), 44–58. https://doi.org/10.14421/EkBis.2022.6.1.1551
- Barhate, B., & Dirani, K. M. (2022). Career aspirations of generation Z: a systematic literature review. *European Journal of Training and Development*, 46(1/2), 139–157. https://doi.org/10.1108/EJTD-07-2020-0124
- Fallah Shayan, N., Mohabbati-Kalejahi, N., Alavi, S., & Zahed, M. A. (2022). Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) as a Framework for Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR). *Sustainability*, 14(3), 1222. https://doi.org/10.3390/su14031222
- Febrian, W. D., Panjaitan, A. R. P., Kamsariaty, Soehaditama, J. P., & Supardi. (2023). Human Capital Strategic: Organization Commitment, Training Need Analysis, Development People, Individual Development Plan, and Performance Appraisal. *International Journal* of Integrative Sciences, 2(4), 455–468. https://doi.org/10.55927/ijis.v2i4.3636
- Fitriah, D., Agustin, E., Warmasih, W., Gadzali, S. S., & Ausat, A. M. A. (2023). Analysis of the Effect of No Work No Pay Policy on Employees of PT Taekwang Industrial Indonesia during the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Journal on Education*, 5(3), 10312–10317. https://jonedu.org/index.php/joe/article/view/1927
- Gadzali, S. S., Ausat, A. M. A., Mahardhani, A. J., Sulton, S., & Sunarto, S. (2023). Analysis of Human Capital Development Aspects. *Proceedings of the International Conference on Economic, Management, Business and Accounting, ICEMBA 2022, 17 December 2022,*

Tanjungpinang, Riau Islands, Indonesia, 1–6. https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.17-12-2022.2333189

- Gadzali, S. S., Gazalin, J., Sutrisno, S., Prasetya, Y. B., & Ausat, A. M. A. (2023). Human Resource Management Strategy in Organisational Digital Transformation. *Jurnal Minfo Polgan*, 12(2), 760–770. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.33395/jmp.v12i2.12508
- Hoff, K. A., Song, Q. C., Wee, C. J. M., Phan, W. M. J., & Rounds, J. (2020). Interest fit and job satisfaction: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 123, 103503. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2020.103503
- Maldonado, L. G., Kim, K., & Threeton, M. D. (2020). An Application of Holland's Theory to Career Interests and Selected Careers of Automotive Technology Students. *Journal of Career and Technical Education*, *35*(1), 36–54.
- Nur'aeni, Ausat, A. M. A., Purnomo, Y. J., Munir, A. R., & Suherlan. (2022). Do Motivation, Compensation, and Work Environment Improve Employee Performance: A Literature Review. *International Journal Of Artificial Intelligence Research*, 6(1.2), 1–9. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.29099/ijair.v6i1.2.678
- Rustiawan, I., Ausat, A. M. A., Gadzali, S. S., Suherlan, & Azzaakiyyah, H. K. (2023). Determinants of Employee Dedication to the Company as a Whole. *Community Development Journal: Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat*, 4(1), 708–712. https://doi.org/10.31004/cdj.v4i1.12454
- Setyawati, N. W., Woelandari PG, D. S., & Rianto, M. R. (2022). Career Development, Motivation and Promotion on Employee Performance. *East Asian Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 1(9), 1957–1970. https://doi.org/10.55927/eajmr.v1i9.1453
- Sun, J. Y., & Wang, G. G. (2012). Career Development. In *The Encyclopedia of Human Resource Management* (pp. 98–102). Pfeiffer: A Wiley Imprint. https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118364741.ch16
- Sutrisno, S., Ausat, A. M. A., Permana, R. M., & Santosa, S. (2023). Effective Marketing Strategies for MSMEs during Ramadan in Indonesia. Community Development Journal: Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat, 4(2), 1901–1906. https://doi.org/10.31004/cdj.v4i2.13792
- Weng, Q. (Derek), & Zhu, L. (2020). Individuals' Career Growth Within and Across Organizations: A Review and Agenda for Future Research. *Journal of Career Development*, 47(3), 239–248. https://doi.org/10.1177/0894845320921951
- Wheatley, D. (2017). Employee satisfaction and use of flexible working arrangements. *Work, Employment and Society*, *31*(4), 567–585. https://doi.org/10.1177/0950017016631447
- Zen, A., Siminto, S., Harahap, M. A. K., Prasetya, Y. B., & Ausat, A. M. A. (2023). Effective Leadership: A Literature Review of Concepts, Characteristics, and Best Practices. *Innovative: Journal Of Social Science Research*, 3(2), 2209–2219. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31004/innovative.v3i2.430